Oxford Handbooks Online

Globalization a

Manuel A. Vásquez and David Garbin The Oxford Handbook of the Study of Religion Edited by Michael Stausberg and Steven Engler

Print Publication Date: Nov 2016 Subject: Religion, Religion and Society

Online Publication Date: Jun 2017 DOI: 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780198729570.013.46

Abstract and Keywords

This chapter explores the key factors involved in the interaction between religion and globalization. It highlights the roles played by transnational networks, fields, and regimes, as well as migrant and religious diasporas, mass culture, and electronic media in the global circulation and appropriation of religious practices, beliefs, symbols, artifacts, and identities. Using the examples of religious networks associated with Islam, Hinduism, and Christianities, the chapter also argues that while the economic dimensions of religion in a context of globalization are central, the dynamics of global religious fields cannot be reduced to those of the world capitalist system. Religious flows and networks are multi-directional. There is thus a need to develop interdisciplinary and multi-sited approaches to these flows and networks, examining the ways in which they challenge fixed centerperiphery models and produce alternative power/geometries shaping religious identities, cultures, and embodied as well as spatialized ontologies.

Keywords: diaspora, globalization, glocalization, hybridization, migration, transnationalism, religion, Tablīghī Jamā'at, Universal Church of the Kingdom of God

Chapter Summary

- Trans-local religious dynamics, linked for instance to trade and missionary networks, are not new and originated before the consolidation of the modern international system.
- Some of the 'command centers' in the contemporary global religious field have already been central in the spread of age-old 'World' Religions. Others are emerging in the 'global South,' in countries such as Brazil, Nigeria, and Ghana.

Page 1 of 21

PRINTED FROM OXFORD HANDBOOKS ONLINE (www.oxfordhandbooks.com). © Oxford University Press, 2018. All Rights Reserved. Under the terms of the licence agreement, an individual user may print out a PDF of a single chapter of a title in Oxford Handbooks Online for personal use (for details see Privacy Policy and Legal Notice).

Subscriber: University of Oxford; date: 25 November 2018

- The interplay of globalization, migration, and religion has been dramatically intensified by rapid innovations in transportation and computer-mediated communications.
- Migrants, minorities, and diasporas are key actors of the globalization of religion and are integral to the contemporary expansion of globe-spanning religious networks associated with Islam, Hinduism, and (primarily Pentecostal and Charismatic) Christianities.
- While the economic dimensions of religion are central, the dynamics of global religious fields cannot be reduced to those of the capitalist world system, with a clear center and periphery. Religious flows and networks are multi-directional, requiring interdisciplinary and multi-sited approaches.

Two Vignettes

The Temple of Solomon of the Brazilian Igreja Universal do Reino de Deus ([Neo-Pentecostal] Universal Church of the Kingdom of God—UCKG) rises majestically over the bustling district of Brás in the center of São Paulo, the second largest city in Latin (p. 685) America. Built at a cost of over US\$300 million, the eighteen-story building is a replica of the original temple in Jerusalem as imagined by the church, complete with soaring ornate columns, elaborate gardens and water fountains, and imposing gold-plated doors. The UCKG went as far as spending more than \$8 million to bring stones from Israel to build the temple, stones that, in the words of Edir Macedo, the church's founder, directly witnessed Jesus's life and ministry (Romero 2014).

When asked about why he built the Solomon's Temple, Macedo articulates a geo-spiritual pastoral project that places Brazil at the center of a vast "globally integrated network," which inverts the country's peripheral place in the capitalist world system, in effect, mirroring Brazil's standing as one of the BRICS—i.e. one of five major emerging economies, Brazil, Russia, India, China, and South Africa (Mafra et al., 2013; on Brazil's role in the new global religious economy, see Rocha/Vásquez 2014). Making reference to Joseph's dream in the Hebrew Bible that foretold how his brothers would eventually bow before him after having cast him out and sold him as a slave, Macedo declared that he foresees "all religions and nations of the world bowing down [estarão se curvando] before Solomon's Temple." Macedo has also stated that he would like Solomon's Temple to overshadow the famous Christ at Corcovado in Rio de Janeiro as the image that the world has of Brazil.

The UCKG is also known for its very public exorcisms of evil spirits that it holds responsible for the everyday tribulations of urban Brazilians. These exorcisms often circulate widely on YouTube and are often used by UCKG missionaries abroad to demonstrate the church's efficacy not only in carrying out the Great Commission, Jesus's

call to make disciples of all nations, but also in fulfilling the church's injunction to potential adherents to "stop suffering" (pare de sofrir), as the church's motto states. In places like Mozambique and Angola, these videos are deployed to demonstrate the UCKG's efficacy in fighting feitiçaria, "witchcraft" (Van de Kamp 2013). Until recently, these exorcisms were beamed globally by Rede Record, now the second most popular television network in Brazil, owned since 1990 by Edir Macedo. These images of spiritual warfare are a key dimension of what anthropologist Simon Coleman (2000) has called a global Charismatic culture, which includes the construction of disciplined subjects not only through the expert use of the latest developments in communication technologies, but also through booming entertainment (music, most prominently) and self-help (books and tapes) industries.

Christian Charismatic referents. Circulating among the YouTube exorcism clips is a widely popular one of a 'witch doctor' *catcheur* ("wrestler") who challenges an Evangelical pastor in Kinshasa. The staged fight ends with 'Luck Mistique,' the catcheur, confronting the pastor with a smoking *fétiche*, whereupon the Pentecostal preacher falls flat on his back (<http://is.gd/cz41Tu>). Under Luck Mistique's control, the pastor then proceeds to eat pages of the Bible and to wash them down, for good measure, with a large bottle of cheap beer, as the crowd cheers on the defeat of the *faux pasteur* ("fake pastor"). This video shows that spiritual combat has now become a global religious spectacle staged and disseminated by multiple actors operating in multiple locations and scales. Of course spiritual warfare is an old phenomenon. However, Meyer (1999) and others have shown how, in Africa, witchcraft and use of *fétiches*, etc. have been 'translated' into Pentecostal idioms, as part of a global—yet local and intimate—struggle between good and evil forces in postcolonial times (see also Geschiere 2013).

The second vignette takes us to London—Stratford (East London) to be more precise. Stratford, in the 'superdiverse' borough of Newham (Vertovec 2007), was the recent host of the 2012 Olympic Games, a global mega-event promoting another kind of universal and ritualized sacredness hinging on the quasi-religious function and moral project of so-called 'Olympic values' (see Cusack, "Sports," this volume). The Games provided an immeasurable opportunity for London and for a range of other local, national, and international stakeholders, corporations, public, and private bodies to capitalize on the global mass appeal of such a mega-event. The 2012 Games had a major impact on this formerly industrial zone of the 'Global City.' The construction of the Olympic Park and its associated transport infrastructures transformed this part of London into one of the largest urban regeneration sites in Europe.

Adjacent to the Olympic Park, the presence of another local actor, the Islamic group Tablighi Jamaat (TJ), has also had an impact on the discursive construction of place and Otherness in global and multicultural context. The TJ were embroiled in a conflict over the development of what became pejoratively known as 'the Olympic mega-mosque,' intended to replace a complex of prefabricated buildings as TJ's main place of worship in London. From its modest origin as a localized Islamic revivalist and reformist movement

Page 3 of 21

in colonial India, the TJ has gradually acquired a transnational scope, mainly through the mobility and migration of its members and affiliates. Traveling to "convey" (tabligh) the Islamic message is still considered a prime component of this global missionary work. Tablighis (exclusively males) go to silla (spiritual retreat) and attend ishtima (large religious gatherings) across Britain and abroad and many regularly visit the large markaz in Dewsbury, where the European headquarters of the TJ are located. While this transnational Islamic movement rejects any form of involvement in political affairs, the controversy surrounding the initial plan for the new mosque in Stratford has forced the TJ to be more visible and to respond to political and media pressure on both local and national levels.

The TJ can be seen as global religious movement, relying on a loose polycentric organization, and shaped by the global forces of migration, diasporization, or transnational (p. 687) mobility networks (e.g. old and new trade routes). However, each local context constitutes a space of 'friction'; a "friction [which] inflects historical trajectories, enabling, excluding, and particularizing" as Tsing (2005, 6) argues. The local is both shaping and shaped by the global, and the deployment of modes of interaction with and within different—religious or and non-religious—publics cannot be understood without accounting for processes of translation, hybridization, and adaption—even if religious discourses of purification and authenticity tend to be hegemonic. The global/local dialectics can perhaps be best framed through a micro/macro politics of 'scale.' While for Tablighis the experience of faith is constructed as a retreat from the *dunya* (the "world"), it relies on a nexus connecting different socio-spatial scales: the disciplined and reformed body, the localized territories of Islamic piety interaction, socialization and differentiation; and the globalized sphere of Islamic universalism (*ummah*) and traveling missions "in the way of God" (*nafr*).

These two vignettes illustrate the complex interplay between religion and globalization, throwing into relief the multifarious processes and actors involved in this interaction, including the roles that transnational migrants, religious entrepreneurs, and pilgrims/ tourists, as well as global media, play in the creation, circulation, and consumption of religious images, narratives, and practices. The vignettes also demonstrate how contemporary capitalism and mass consumer culture are redefining notions of space and time, foregrounding the urban as a staging place for the sacred and heightening the tension between dynamics of boundary-making in the search for purity and boundary-crossing, as part of widespread hybridization and transculturation within and among religions. This chapter offers a panoramic view of these processes and the scholarly literature that has addressed them.

Understanding Globalization

Mobility has been an enduring and widespread feature of human history. However, not all forms of mobility can be characterized as globalization, at least as we understand it today. In the most general terms, globalization is "the widening, deepening and speeding up of worldwide interconnectedness in all aspects of contemporary social life, from the cultural to the criminal, the financial to the spiritual" (Held et al. 1999, 2). As such, there have been many prominent examples of trans-local movement and exchange in early human history, such as the Silk Road, which emerged in some shape or form during the Han dynasty (226 BCE to 220 CE), or the Mongol Empire in the thirteenth century that extended from Korea to the gates of Vienna. Nevertheless, true global interconnectedness only starts with the rise of what sociologist Immanuel Wallerstein (1974) calls the modern capitalist world system in the sixteenth century, as the Spanish and Portuguese empires established intercontinental routes in which slaves, colonists, raw materials, coins, and commodities circulated. At this point, we can refer to an "expansive globalization ... defined more by its reach and impact than the velocity of the flows" (Held et al. 1999, 23).

(p. 688) Globalization gathered considerable momentum following the Industrial Revolution and the age of free trade in the 1800s, which was only temporarily curtailed by World War I and the Great Depression. During this period we witnessed the emergence of a 'thick globalization,' in which global networks and flows attained "high intensity, high velocity and high impact propensity across all the domains or facets of social life from the economic to the cultural" (Held et al. 1999, 21). In the context of the inventions of new transportation technologies, such as the steam locomotive, the car, and the telegraph, this period was marked by pervasive migration: between 1850 and 1914, close to 4 percent of the world's population—60–70 million people—left their countries of origin (Osterhammel/Petersson 2005).

The advent of thick globalization inaugurated an ongoing process of "time-space" compression" (Harvey 1989), in which technological innovations have increasingly sped up the pace of life, "obliterating space through time," with space appearing "to shrink to a 'global village' of telecommunications and a 'spaceship earth' of economic and ecological interdependencies ... as time horizons shorten to the point where the present is all there is" (Harvey 1989, 240). According to Harvey, time-space compression accelerated dramatically in the late 1960s, as the economies of scale that characterized the postwar Fordist-Keynesian regime of production gave way to flexible production systems based on decentered transnational networks. Because this flexible production regime is knowledge-intensive, based on the rapid circulation of information and culture, alongside capital, the transition has also ushered in important changes in cultural and religious fields. In this context, religions have become part of a 'postmodern condition,' providing symbols, images, narratives, practices, and identities—from Lakota sweat lodges, Santería drumming, and Ayahuasca-based shamanism to Yoga, Reiki healing, and Wicca Sabbats—that are combined in new hybrid formations. As the case of the New Age Movement shows, often these new formations are commodified, entering a thriving therapeutic, self-help industry that plays a key role in "making the human sacred," as Hexam and Poewe (1997) put it. Alternatively, religions may become part of the "society

Page 5 of 21

of the spectacle" (Debord 1994), as the architectural monumentality of the two vignettes with which we started shows. Or religions may also serve to cope with the cultural whiplash produced by globalization's time–space compression by redrawing and reinforcing cognitive maps built on dualistic cosmologies which set the believer against an evil, corrupt, secular world or against other religions in increasingly pluralistic contexts. The rapid global expansion of Neo-Pentecostalism, such as the one advanced by the Universal Church of the Kingdom of God, and rectificationist Islam, like the Tablighi Jamaat, illustrate this dynamic.

While Harvey's neo-Marxist account of cultural dimensions of globalization—as a postmodern sensibility 'mimetic' of structural changes in contemporary capitalism—is in many ways compelling, it is, in the end, too one-sided to capture the multiple processes at play. Anthropologist Arjun Appadurai has suggested that the "new global cultural economy has to be seen as a complex, disjunctive order" that confounds "even the most complex and flexible theories of global development that have come out of the Marxist tradition" (1996, 32, 33). He proposes, instead, a framework to explore the (p. 689) divergences and convergences among five global cultural flows or 'scapes,' that is, "fluid, irregular landscapes" that are "deeply perspectival constructs, inflected by the historical, linguistic, and political situatedness of different sorts of actors: nation-states, multinational, diasporic communities, as well as subnational groupings and movements (whether religious, political, or economic), and even intimate face-to-face groups, such as villages, neighborhoods, and families" (1996, 33). Among these flows are ethnoscapes, referring not only to the transnational movement of immigrants and refugees, but also of tourists, entrepreneurs, and missionaries; financescapes, the global circulation of capital at blinding speeds; technoscapes, the emergence and movement of new communication, information, and transportation technologies; mediascapes, the expansive "distribution of the electronic capabilities to produce and disseminate" (1996, 35) culture in the forms of "image-centered, narrative-based accounts of strips of reality" (1996, 35); and ideoscapes, notions such as human rights, citizenship, civil society, and democracy that have become widespread.

Despite the fact that Appadurai acknowledges that religious actors are actively engaged in the process global work of imagination, he does not consider religion a distinct scape. Drawing from her work on Haitian Vodou in Haiti and the United States, Elizabeth McAlister (1998, 156) suggests the term 'religioscapes' to characterize "the religious maps (and attendant theologies) of diasporic communities who are also in global flow and flux." Thomas Tweed goes even further, suggesting a 'hydrodynamic' theory that sees the 'sacroscapes' of religions as "confluences of organic-cultural flows that intensify joy and confront suffering by drawing on human and suprahuman forces to make homes and cross boundaries" (2006, 54).

Tweed's theory goes a long way toward de-territorializing religion by not assuming that it has an essence tied to a particular place or people. However, it is not without its limitations. Vásquez (2008) has argued that overreliance on aquatic metaphors to understand how religion operates in the global context leads to an excessive anti-

Page 6 of 21

structuralism, which elides widespread dynamics of closure, exclusion, containment, friction, and surveillance (Cunningham 2004; Tsing 2005). In order to understand not only the processes of de-territorialization that accompany globalization, but also those of reterritorialization, as well as to capture the persistence and even exacerbation of old power asymmetries and the creation of new ones, Vásquez suggests critiquing and augmenting Tweed's analysis with metaphors of relationality such as networks and fields (2011, 292–307).

Religion and Globalization: Key Processes, Actors, and Media

Early work on religion and globalization took a macro perspective. Roland Robertson (1991, 215-216; 1992, 27), for example, focused on the contributions of religion to the (p. 690) intensification of international interdependence (internationalization) and the global spread of shared notions of humanity (humanization), the person (individualization), and modern society (societalization). These processes generate a dialectical interplay between "particularization of the universal" and "universalization of the particular" (1992, 130), which Robertson argued was most saliently expressed through the concept of 'glocalization,' or global localization, the dynamic through which ideas, symbols, practices, and goods, which are unmoored from their original local referents and circulate globally, are creatively adapted to new local conditions as they are 'consumed' by situated social actors (Robertson 1995). In the study of religion, the concept of glocalization has been used by Vásquez and Marquardt (2003) to argue from an approach that foregrounds the pervasiveness and generativity of hybridity in religious discourses and practices over against traditional perspectives that see the public presence and vitality of religion as declining (the secularization thesis) or that stress religious competition among self-contained traditions within pluralistic religious fields.

For his part, Peter Beyer (1994; 2006), another pioneer in the study of religion and globalization, has drawn from sociologist Niklas Luhmann's systems theory, to point to how the emergence of the category of religion and of the system of world religions, was central to the process of globalization. Here, Beyer offers an important complement and corrective to Immanuel Wallerstein's theory of the world capitalist system, which underplays the role of ideas and values in the process of globalization.

More recent work on religion and globalization has tended to take ethnographic and case studies approaches, which focus primarily on specific actors and vectors.

Transnational Religious Networks, Fields, and Regimes

In a context of globalization, the diversification in immigration flows has radically altered the racial, ethnic, and religious landscape of societies of settlement. Steven Vertovec (2007) speaks of "super-diversity" to describe the highly variegated social formations that are emerging, particularly in global cities such as New York and London, out of the complex interplay of multiple variables such as country of origin, migration channel, legal status, etc. Moreover, immigrants today, in contrast to those in the past who were expected to leave behind their countries of origin and assimilate into the societies of settlement, have the means to be "simultaneously embedded." To describe this phenomenon, Linda Basch, Nina Glick Schiller, and Cristina Szanton Blanc (1994) use the term 'transnationalism,' denoting "the processes by which immigrants forge and sustain multi-stranded social relations that link together societies of origin and settlement" (1994, 7). 'Transmigrants'—immigrants engaged in multiple social relations spanning national borders—"live their lives across international borders" through the articulation in everyday life of "multiple interlocking networks of social relations through which ideas, practices, and resources are unequally exchanged, organized, and transformed" (Levitt/Glick Schiller 2004, 1009).

(p. 691) At the micro, everyday life level, transnational religious networks play crucial roles throughout the process of migration and settlement, allowing migrants keep in touch with their places of origin through 'social remittances' (Levitt 2001). In her study of unauthorized immigration from Latin America to the United States, sociologist Jacqueline Hagan found that "religion permeates the entirety of the migration experience, from decision making and departure through the dangerous undocumented journey from their home communities north to the United States" (2008, 7). Here religion acts as a transnational vehicle, serves as moral guide, 'companion,' and spiritual support, and also operates as a sanctuary and advocate for the rights of immigrants in 'host societies.'

At the institutional level, Peggy Levitt has identified at least three types of transnational religious organizations. "Extended transnational religious organizations" basically "broaden and deepen a global religious system that is already powerful and legitimate" (2004, 6). Thus, a central concern among this type of organization is the maintenance of orthodoxy, which given the scale that these networks often have, can seldom be fully achieved. This is why the concept of glocalization is particularly relevant to characterize the production, circulation, and performance of religious phenomena in these organizations. The prime example of an extended transnational religious organization is the Catholic Church, which is sustained by the complex interactions among the Vatican, global religious orders, regional and national episcopal bodies, as well as local parishes, all held together by networks and flows operating at multiple scales and by a universalizing doctrine.

Despite the centralized and hierarchical institutional morphology of the transnational Catholic regime—following Robertson's notion of religious glocalization—Catholicism's universalizing doctrine assumes myriad local expressions as a result of widespread processes of hybridization with indigenous traditions. The creative cross-fertilization of Catholicism in the Americas with Native American traditions such as shamanism and

Page 8 of 21

animism and African-based practices of divination and spirit incorporation offers a good example of the dynamics of glocalization for extended transnational religious organizations. Moreover, transnational movements such as Liberation Theology and the Catholic Charismatic Renewal, which often travel through immigrants, as the case of Latinos in the United States shows, introduce centripetal and centrifugal dynamics that revitalize the Church, enabling it to 'broaden and deepen' its global reach.

According to Levitt (2004, 8–11), "negotiated transnational religious organizations" constitute a second type of transnational institutional morphology, presenting a more flexible and decentralized morphology. Thus, in contrast to extended transnational religious networks in which authority and resources are more centralized, even if always contested, the various interconnected nodes in the more flexible organizations must negotiate "with respect to authority, organization, and ritual. There is generally no one leader or administrative hierarchy to set policy and dictate how things are done. A more diverse, diluted set of partnerships emerges that are malleable and shift over time" (Levitt 2004, 10).

(p. 692) The best examples here would be many independent Pentecostal churches from countries such as Nigeria, Ghana, Brazil, and the Philippines that have set up churches in various host countries that minister transnationally to fellow immigrants, assisting them, as we saw, through the immigration and settlement process (see Ukah, "Expansion," this volume). In light of the tension between social disembedding and time-space compression in contemporary globalization, the loose connections within these negotiated transnational networks give them a comparative advantage over extended transnational organizations like the Catholic Church: they are more nimble, portable, and responsive, capable of creative adaptation to changing environments and media. No wonder, then, that Latin American and African Pentecostal churches are spearheading a process of 'reverse missionizing,' in which countries to which Christian missionaries were once sent, now send missionaries back to former missionary nations in Europe and North America. Reverse missionizing is part and parcel of the dramatic shift in Christianity's center of gravity to the global South (Jenkins 2011; Ukah, "Expansion," this volume).

In Levitt's typology, the third type of transnational religious networks are "recreated organizations" formed by "groups with guidance from home-country leaders" (2004, 11) which seek to replicate local practices, beliefs, and modes of organization abroad. According to Levitt, movements such as the Swaminarayanan or Swadhyaya Parivar, which "strongly reinforce members' ties with their home country [in this case India] often at the expense of receiving-country social integration," fit this model (2004, 3). While these movements do represent a kind of "long distance nationalism," they often reimagine the nation in utopian terms. The nation becomes the source of universal ethical and metaphysical teachings that dovetail with New Age notions of self-improvement and personal spiritual quests, allowing non-immigrants that join these transnational movements.

Levitt recognizes that these three categories hardly exhaust the multiple ways in which transnational religious networks operate. She has called for "a more systematic study of how the various constituent elements in these networks, including formal structural ties at the local, regional, and national levels, informal ties between leaders and members, labor power and resource exchanges, funding, and programmatic coordination" are combined and operate (2004, 15).

Diasporic Religions and Religious Diasporas

Since the concept of transnationalism presupposes the nation state, it can only be applied to cross-boundary processes that emerged after the Peace of Westphalia ended the Thirty-Years War in 1648, establishing autonomous nations, with religion serving as one of the criteria for demarcation. In other words, trans-local dynamics that originated before the consolidation of the modern international system but that continue to have an effect in contemporary globalization cannot be rigorously characterized by the concept of transnationalism. As an alternative, some scholars have advanced the (p. 693) notion of diaspora. In its most general sense, diaspora refers to dispersed populations, deriving from diaspeirein, a Greek term which literally means "to scatter the seeds." In the ancient Mediterranean world, the term designated the spread of Hellenistic culture through conquest, colonization, immigration, and mercantile networks. There is, however, a narrower definition of diaspora modeled after the paradigmatic Jewish experience of exile in Babylon following the destruction of the Second Temple in Jerusalem. According to this more restricted definition, diasporas would be self-conscious groups which have been forcefully displaced from an original homeland to more than one host land and which unable to return and not fully accepted in the new contexts of settlement—have maintained cultural, linguistic, and spiritual connections with their place of origin through idealized memories and utopian visions of the homeland (Safran 1991, 83-84).

Given the fact that many dispersed populations exhibit strong elements of diasporic consciousness while not fully conforming to this ideal type, Clifford suggests that we take a more flexible definition of diaspora, which explores ambivalence, contestation, and the waxing and waning of "diasporism, depending on changing possibilities—obstacles, openings, antagonisms, and connections—in their host countries and transnationally" (Clifford 1994, 306).

Both transnationalism and diaspora point to the immigrant experience of 'bifocality' or 'multifocality,' challenging the traditional assumption that migration always entails assimilation to the receiving country's hegemonic culture and the loss of the sending country's way of life. The concepts of transnationalism and diaspora characterize different dynamics of mobility. Whereas transnationalism refers to simultaneity across present-day localities, such that decisions taken in the society of settlement have an impact in the society of origin and vice versa, the notion of diaspora also operates trans-

temporally, joining multiple spaces through a work of imagination and memory that links past, present, and future.

A seminal work on religion and diaspora is Tweed's ethnography of Cuban-Americans in Miami, who came to the United States in successive waves following the Cuban revolution in 1959. Unable to return to Cuba, they, among other things, built in Miami a shrine to Our Lady of Charity, the country's patroness. This shrine has a series of architectural features that incorporate Cuban history and landscape, but in a way that imagines a mythical Cuba before the revolution and a utopian Cuba liberated from communist rule. Tweed argues that diasporic religion operates through three spatiotemporal configurations or 'chronotopes': the locative, the translocative, and the supralocative. The locative refers to the diasporic group's work in building a new home through the transposition of imagined landscapes and the materialization of memories associated with the homeland, from which it has been forcibly exiled and to which it cannot return. The translocative points to "the tendency among first- and secondgeneration migrants to symbolically move between homeland and new land" (Tweed 1997, 95). Finally, the supralocative involves vertical connections with the cosmos or with religious utopias (spaces that transcend all places) that may call for the overturning of the existing fallen or iniquitous order.

(p. 694) In his work on Garifuna shamans in Honduras and New York, Paul C. Johnson (2007) elaborates further on Tweed's insights, showing that religion does not link just societies of origin and settlement; it often involves "multiple diasporic horizons" (7) that orient groups in relation to manifold locations in trajectories of migration that are not always unilinear. While Johnson returns to the paradigmatic example of the Jewish diaspora, which is marked by a "repeated experience of rediasporization" (Boyarin/ Boyarin 2002, 11), he adds an important distinction in the ways in which religion, migration, and globalization are linked by the diasporic experience. He defines 'diasporic religions' as "the collected practices of dislocated social groups whose affiliation is not primarily or essentially based on religion but whose acts, locutions, and sentiments toward the distant homeland are mediated by, and articulated through, a religious culture" (Johnson 2007, 258). This definition would fit the Garifuna as well as the Cuban diaspora that Tweed has studied. In contrast, Johnson refers to 'religious diasporas' "to denote the extensions in space of a group whose most salient reference is religious identity rather than ethnic, racial, linguistic, or any other social bond and whose process of dispersion is a direct consequence of that affiliation" (258). Such a characterization would apply to the Puritans emigrating from England and Scotland to North America or the Mormons living in Mexico or elsewhere. While both diasporic religion and religious diasporas are implicated in the current processes of globalization, more research needs to be done on religion's specific contributions to global dynamics. Arguably, Brazilian neo-Pentecostalism, like the Universal Church of the Kingdom of God, can be said to be not only a diasporic religion, in the sense that it is carried by dispersed Brazilian immigrants and religious entrepreneurs, but also a religious diaspora, since these religious actors see

themselves above all as members of the church of the elect, as demonstrated by their baptism in the Holy Spirit and the charismas associated with it. Moreover, their global professions of faith fulfill the Great Commission, Jesus Christ's call to apostles to "make disciples of all nations."

Media and Virtuality

Appadurai argues that one of the key sources of the de- and re-territorialization of culture has to do with the widening "distribution of the electronic capabilities to produce and disseminate information" (1993, 35). The interplay of globalization, migration, and religion has been dramatically intensified by rapid innovations in computer-mediated communications (CMCs), particularly expansion of the Internet and, more recently, the rise of social media such as Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube. Some scholars have argued that CMCs challenge the 'metaphysics of presence' (i.e. the privileging of physical presence and face-to-face interactions as authenticity) and the distinction between virtuality and reality. Baudrillard (1994) suggests that CMCs are now capable of producing the 'hyper-real,' that is, experiences that are more intense, more vivid, and more all-consuming and all-encompassing than the 'real.'

(p. 695) This capacity to generate a virtual world, perhaps even a hyper-real one, has enormous consequences for religion. For one thing, it means that authentic and authoritative religious experience is no longer the monopoly of elites dwelling in a particular place which is claimed to be a sacred center (e.g. Rome). Now, many people skilled in the use of electronic media are in principle able to invent traditions and generate a religious following, if they can generate sufficient charisma. This 'decentering' of authority leads Brenda Brasher (2001, 25) to argue that cyberspace represents the "ultimate diaspora," which by "materializing a perpetual presence ... offers the ideal public space for a people without history."

Brasher (2001, 6) sees this electronic diasporization and 'virtualization of community' as a positive development. On the ground, among migrants, reality is far more complex. To begin with, there is a divide between those who have easy access to the new media and those that do not, which is affected by factors such as class, race, gender, and immigrant status, and which renders the impact of CMCs uneven. For instance, the spread of the Hindutva movement has been spearheaded by successful Indian entrepreneurs, doctors, software engineers, and journalists turned freelance scholars in diaspora, who have the financial resources, time, and technological competence to combine ethnic and religious primordialism (i.e. the recovery of an imagined ancestral land and a unified Hindu people with a glorious myth of origins) with de-territorialized cyberspaces. In contrast, when unauthorized Latino migrants in the United States organized massive demonstrations in 2005, demanding a comprehensive immigration reform, they relied for their mobilizations on Spanish-radio hosts and TV news anchors, who, in between salsa shows and popular telenovela (soap opera) broadcasts, encouraged listeners and viewers to take to the streets (Vásquez 2008). In yet another case, Hirschkind (2001) describes how the

Page 12 of 21

circulation of sermons in cassettes has produced an 'ethical soundscape,' a transnational oral culture among Muslims in Egypt and beyond. In other words, it is too simplistic to think that new media take over all aspects of everyday life. We need to look more carefully at the actual relationships among religion, CMCs, and mobility in particular places in order to draw conclusions which take account of diversity.

In many cases, CMCs do not in fact render physical presence irrelevant or erase the importance of locality under a flood of free-floating signifiers. Rather, CMCs and physical presence often sustain a relationship of reciprocal influencing, with the Internet serving to make locality and material things more significant by beaming them globally through a process of 'global localization.' This was the case with an apparition of the Virgin Mary on the windows of a bank building in Clearwater, Florida, which quickly made the national and international news, attracting not only pilgrims from throughout the area, but tourists from Europe and Australia vacationing in nearby Orlando (Vásquez/Marquardt 2000).

The complex relation between reality and virtuality is also illustrated by the proliferation of cyber-rituals and cyber-pilgrimages. While, as Scheifinger (2013, 126) observes, "online *puja* is a valid and efficacious form of ritual" among Hindus, in the diaspora these electronic performances become part of the work of imagination that memorializes and enacts the migrants' embodied, multi-sensory experiences with sacred (p. 696) landscapes, objects, traditions, and incarnate deities and territorialized spirits in the homeland.

Heidi Campbell has suggested the term 'digital religion' to characterize "the technological and cultural space that is evoked when we talk about how online and offline religious spheres have become blended and integrated. We can think of digital religion as a bridge that connects and extends online religious practices and spaces with offline religious contexts, and vice versa" (2013, 3-4). Campbell's notion can also help us make sense of the often paradoxical ways in which CMCs, religion, globalization, and migration interact to produce hybrid identities, practices, and spaces (see also Krüger, "Media," this volume).

Conclusion

Anthropologist Thomas Csordas identifies four vectors of "transnational transcendence": migration, mobility, mediatization, and missionization (2009, 5–6). These modalities roughly correspond to the key processes, media, and actors behind the contemporary globalization that we have characterized. These vectors can be isolated for analytical purposes, but, on the ground, they often interact with each other, alternatively reinforcing each other or generating borderlands.

The interaction of these modalities produces both homogenization and cultural heterogeneity and transculturation. On the one hand, religious globalization may involve McDonaldization, i.e. the one-directional spread of made-in-the-US religion as a complement to American geopolitical hegemony and pre-eminence in financial and media networks, as the United States continues to be a seminal node in global 'spirit industries' (Ritzer 1996; Endres 2010). The quintessential example here is some versions of the gospel of health and wealth. On the other hand, in the interplay of religion, migration, and globalization, emerging national and local actors across the globe are increasingly developing alternative religious styles, services, entrepreneurial strategies, distribution networks, and markets. The result has been the articulation of a polycentric cartography of religious globalization with multiple key nodes of religious production, circulation, and consumption. Offutt (2015, 24), for example, refers to "New Centers of Evangelicalism (NCEs)" in Latin America and Africa, "shar[ing] the globe with their preexisting Western Centers of Evangelicalism (WCEs)" and exchanging resources with the latter, particularly through a growing and diverse entrepreneurial class.

Saskia Sassen (1998) has noted that, despite all the talk that globalization has made the world flat, the contemporary global scene is marked by deepening inequalities. In particular, global cities such as New York, London, and Tokyo have become heavily networked 'command centers' in the global economy where financial and corporate services are concentrated and where innovation in knowledge-based industries takes place, a concentration that is also accompanied by growing inequalities within these cities. The uneven spatial configuration of the global economic system dovetails to some extent (p. 697) with the new geography of global religious production. As crossroads to the world, topoi where immigrants, business people, tourists, and cultural cosmopolitans interact, global cities in the North are indeed incubators of great religious creativity (Orsi 1999). The salience of the global city as a spiritual battleground (Garbin 2013) or an amplifying node for the performance of religious geopolitical visions explains the controversy around the Tablighi Jamaat mosque, with which we started this chapter.

However, while the logics of late capitalism may go a long way toward explaining the new cartographies of the sacred, the dynamics of the global religious field cannot be reduced to those of the world capitalist system, with a clear center and periphery. The religious field has its own variegated architecture and spatial logics. Some of the 'command centers' in the new global religious economy—such New Delhi and Mumbai in India and Beijing and Shanghai in China—have already been central in the production and spread of age-old 'World' Religions such as Hinduism, Buddhism, Confucianism, and Taoism.

Others nodes such as São Paulo, Rio de Janeiro, and Salvador in Brazil, Lagos and Ibadan in Nigeria, Accra in Ghana, Kinshasa in the Democratic Republic of the Congo, and Johannesburg in South Africa, although always connected in a subaltern position to the world capitalist system through slavery, colonialism, and the African diaspora, have only recently begun to play a leading role in religious globalization. These nodes highlight the proliferation of multi-directional and multi-scalar religious flows and networks, going not only from 'North' to 'South' but also in the opposite direction, as immigrants and

Page 14 of 21

religious entrepreneurs reverse-missionize, exorcize demons, summon ancestor spirits, or clean karmic residues in the metropole, while in the process contributing to religious diversity and vitality in places like London, Paris, Amsterdam, New York, or Atlanta, despite the pressures of secular (late) modernity. Thus, in order to understand the ongoing entwinement of religion and globalization, the study of religion will have to be not only interdisciplinary but also multi-sited, strategically mapping out established as well as emergent flows, networks, and fields in the polycentric cartography of religious globalization.²

Glossary

Diaspora

from *diaspeirein*, a Greek term which literally means "to scatter the seeds." Often used to refer to self-conscious groups which have been forcibly displaced from an original homeland to more than one host land and which—unable to return and not fully accepted in the new contexts of settlement—have maintained cultural, linguistic, and spiritual connections with their place of origin through idealized memories and utopian visions of the homeland.

(p. 698) Globalization

"The widening, deepening and speeding up of worldwide interconnectedness in all aspects of contemporary social life, from the cultural to the criminal, the financial to the spiritual" (Held et al. 1999, 2).

Glocalization

global localization, the dynamic through which ideas, symbols, practices, and goods—unmoored from their original local referents and circulating globally—are creatively adapted to new local conditions as they are 'consumed' by situated social actors. Hybridization

the emergence of new (religious) identities, practices, theologies, symbols, artifacts, spaces, and institutions out of the combination of (religious) traditions that have become de-territorialized from their traditional local referents.

McDonaldization

a process of homogenization driven by the one-directional spread of made-in-the-US religion and culture as a complement to American geopolitical hegemony and pre-eminence in financial and media networks.

Polycentric global cartography of the sacred

the new irregular global religious space which includes multiple nodes of religious creativity and multi-directional flows and networks of religious production.

Transnationalism

the processes whereby individuals on the move build and sustain widespread relations across national borders, building social networks and fields that span more than one nation, including nations of origin and settlement.

References

Appadurai, Arjun. 1996. *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Basch, Linda, Nina Glick Schiller, and Christina Szanton Blanc. 1994. *Nations Unbound: Transnational Migration, Postcolonial Predicaments, and the Deterritorialized Nation-State*. Langhorne, PA: Gordon and Breach.

Baudrillard, Jean. 1994. Simulacra and Simulation. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Beyer, Peter. 1994. Religion and Globalisation. London: Sage.

Beyer, Peter. 2006. Religions in Global Society. London: Routledge.

Boyarin, Jonathan and Daniel Boyarin. 2002. *The Powers of Diaspora: Two Essays on the Relevance of Jewish Culture*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Brasher, Brenda. 2001. Give Me That On-Line Religion. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Campbell, Heidi. 2013. "Introduction: The Rise of the Study of Digital Religion." In *Digital Religion: Understanding Religious Practice in New Media Worlds*, edited by Heidi Campbell. New York: Routledge, 1–22.

Chesnut, Andrew R. 1997. Born Again in Brazil: The Pentecostal Boom and the Pathogens of Poverty. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.

Clifford, James. 1994. "Diasporas." Cultural Anthropology 9(3): 302-338.

Coleman, Simon. 2000. The Globalisation of Charismatic Christianity: Spreading the Gospel of Prosperity. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Coleman, Simon and Pauline von Hellermann. 2011. *Multi-Sited Ethnography: Problems and Possibilities in the Translocation of Research Methods*. London: Routledge.

Csordas, Thomas. 2009. "Introduction: Modalities of Transnational Transcendence." In *Transnational Transcendence: Essays on Religion and Globalization*, edited by Thomas Csordas. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1–29.

(p. 699) Cunningham, Hillary. 2004. "Nations Rebound? Crossing Orders in a Gated Globe." *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 11(3): 329–350. doi: 10.1080/10702890490493527

Debord, Guy. 1994. The Society of the Spectacle. New York: Zone Books.

Endres, Kirsten. 2010. "'Trading in Spirits'? Transnational Flows, Entrepreneurship, and Commodifications in Vietnamese Spirit Mediumship." In *Traveling Spirits: Migrants, Markets, and Mobilities*, edited by Gertrud Hüwelmeier and Kristine Krause. Oxford and New York: Routledge, 118–132.

Garbin, David. 2013. "Visibility and Invisibility of Migrant Faith in the City: Diaspora Religion and the Politics of Emplacement of Afro-Christian Churches." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 39(5): 677–696. doi: 10.1080/1369183X.2013.756658

Geschiere, Peter. 2013. Witchcraft, Intimacy and Trust: Africa in Comparison. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Hagan, Jacqueline. 2008. *Migration Miracle: Faith, Hope, and Meaning on the Undocumented Journey*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Harvey, David. 1989. The Condition of Postmodernity: An Enquiry into the Origins of Cultural Change. Cambridge, MA: Blackwell.

Held, David, Anthony McGrew, David Goldblatt, and Jonathan Perraton. 1999. *Global Transformations: Politics, Economics and Culture*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Hexam, Irving and Karla Poewe. 1997. New Religions as Global Cultures: Making the Human Sacred. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Hirschkind, Charles. 2001. "Civic Virtue and Religious Reason: An Islamic Counterpublic." *Cultural Anthropology* 16(1): 3–34. doi: 10.1525/can.2001.16.1.3

Jenkins, Philip. 2011. *The Next Christendom: The Coming of Global Christianity*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Johnson, Paul C. 2007. *Diaspora Conversions: Black Carib Religion and the Recovery of Africa*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Levitt, Peggy. 2001. Transnational Villagers. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Levitt, Peggy. 2004. "Redefining the Boundaries of Belonging: The Institutional Character of Transnational Religious Life." *Sociology of Religion* 65(1): 1–18. doi: 10.2307/3712504

Levitt, Peggy and Nina Glick Schiller. 2004. "Conceptualizing Simultaneity: A Transnational Social Field Perspective on Society." *International Migration Review* 38(3): 1002–1039. doi: 10.1111/j.1747-7379.2004.tb00227.xd

McAlister, Elizabeth. 1998. "The Madonna of 115th Street Revisited: Vodou and Haitian Catholicism in the Age of Transnationalism." In *Gatherings in Diaspora: Religious Communities and the New Migration*, edited by Stephen Warner and Judith Wittner. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press, 123–160.

Mafra, Clara, Claudia Swatowiski, and Camila Sampaio. 2013. "Edir Macedo's Pastoral Project: A Globally Integrated Pentecostal Network." In *The Diaspora of Brazilian Religions*, edited by Cristina Rocha and Manuel A. Vásquez. Leiden: Brill, 45–67.

Marcus, George. 1995. "Ethnography in/of the World System: The Emergence of Multi-Sited Ethnography." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 24: 95–117.

Meyer, Birgit. 1999. *Translating the Devil: Religion and Modernity among the Ewe in Ghana*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Offutt, Stephen. 2015. New Centers of Global Evangelicalism in Latin America and Africa. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

(p. 700) Orsi, Robert. 1999. "Crossing the City Line." In *Gods of the City: Religion and the American Urban Landscape*, edited by Robert Orsi. Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1–77.

Osterhammel, Jürgen and Niels P. Petersson. 2005. *Globalization: A Short History*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Ritzer, George. 1996. *The McDonaldization of Society*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Pine Forge Press.

Robertson, Roland. 1991. "Globalization, Modernization, and Postmodernization: The Ambiguous Position of Religion." In *Religion and Social Order*, edited by Roland Robertson and W. R. Garrett. New York: Paragon House, 281–291.

Robertson, Roland. 1992. Globalisation: Social Theory and Global Culture. London: Sage.

Robertson, Roland. 1995. "Glocalization: Time-Space and Homogeneity-Heterogeneity." In *Global Modernities*, edited by Mike Featherstone, Scott Lash, and Roland Robertson. London: Sage, 25–44.

Rocha, Cristina and Manuel A. Vásquez, eds. 2014. *The Diaspora of Brazilian Religions*. Leiden: Brill.

Romero, Simon. 2014. "Temple in Brazil Appeals to a Surge in Evangelicals." *The New York Times*, July 24.

Safran, William. 1991. "Diasporas in Modern Societies: Myths of Homeland and Return." *Diaspora* 1(1): 83–99.

Sassen, Saskia. 1998. *Globalization and its Discontents: Essays on the New Mobility of People and Money*. New York: New Press.

Sassen, Saskia. 2000. "Digital Networks and the State: Some Governance Questions." *Theory, Culture & Society* 17(4): 19–33. doi: 10.1177/02632760022051293

Page 18 of 21

Scheifinger, Heinz. 2013. "Hindu Worship Online and Offline." In *Digital Religion: Understanding Religious Practice in New Media Worlds*, edited by Heidi Campbell. New York: Routledge, 121–127.

Tsing, Anna L. 2005. *Friction: An Ethnography of Global Connection*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Tweed, Thomas. 1997. *Our Lady of the Exile: Diasporic Religion at a Catholic Shrine in Miami*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Tweed, Thomas. 2006. *Crossing and Dwelling: A Theory of Religion*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Van de Kamp, Linda. 2013. "South-South Transnational Spaces of Conquest: Afro-Brazilian Pentecostalism, *Feitiçaria* and the Reproductive Domain in Urban Mozambique." *Exchange* 42(4): 343–365. doi: 10.1163/1572543X-12341284

Van Wyk, Ilana. 2014. The Universal Church of the Kingdom of God in South Africa: A Church of Strangers. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Vásquez, Manuel A. 2008. "Studying Religion in Motion: A Networks Approach." *Method and Theory in the Study of Religion* 20(2): 151–184. doi: 10.1163/157006808X283570

Vásquez, Manuel A. 2011. *More than Belief: A Materialist Theory of Religion*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Vásquez, Manuel A. and Marie F. Marquardt. 2000. "Globalizing the Rainbow Madonna: Old-Time Religion in the Present Age." *Theory, Culture & Society* 17(4): 119–143. doi: 10.1177/02632760022051347

Vásquez, Manuel A. and Marie F. Marquardt. 2003. *Globalizing the Sacred: Religion across the Americas*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.

Vertovec, Steven. 2007. "Super-Diversity." http://www.mmg.mpg.de/research/all-projects/super-diversity/, accessed February 18, 2014.

(p. 701) Wallerstein, Immanuel. 1974. The Modern World System. New York: Academic Press.

Further Reading

Beyer 1994 [A seminal examination of the emergence and dynamics of religious social systems in a context of globalization, using case studies ranging from the Christian Right in the United States and Liberation Theology in Latin America to the Islamic Revolution in Iran and religious environmentalism.]

Page 19 of 21

Global Networks 2014. "Special Issue: The Religious Lives of Migrant Minorities—A Multi-Sited and Transnational Perspective" 14(3): 251-400. [A collection of articles on Christians, Muslims, Hindus, and Buddhists, who live as minorities and transnational migrants in three urban contexts (London, Johannesburg, Kajang-Kuala Lumpur) and whose different national regimes for governing migrant and religious diversity have been shaped historically by the British Empire and its legacy. It offers a good illustration of the pay-offs and challenges of the multi-sited comparative study of religion and globalization.]

Robertson 1992 [One of the earliest systematic treatments of globalization, stressing the roles of religion. It develops key concepts such as internationalization, societalization, individualization, humanization, and glocalization.]

Vásquez/Marquardt 2003 [Explores the interplay of globalization, religion, and migration drawing through case studies in Latin America and among US Latinos in different urban contexts.]

Notes:

- (1) Here Macedo is making reference to Genesis 37:8-9. "Then his brothers said to him [Joseph], 'Are you actually going to reign over us? Or are you really going to rule over us?' So they hated him even more for his dreams and for his words. Now he had still another dream, and related it to his brothers, and said, 'Lo, I have had still another dream; and behold, the sun and the moon and eleven stars were bowing down to me.' He related it to his father and to his brothers; and his father rebuked him and said to him, 'What is this dream that you have had? Shall I and your mother and your brothers actually come to bow ourselves down before you to the ground?' "The report prepared by Rede Record on the inauguration of Solomon's Temple repeatedly pointed to the presence of delegations from Africa and Latin America, representing a gathering of all the tribes of Israel. See http://is.gd/BNE7aP.
- (2) For examples of this type of approach, see Coleman/Von Hellermann (2011) and Marcus (1995) and the special issue of *Global Networks* (2014) edited by Josh DeWind and Manuel Vásquez.

Manuel A. Vásquez

Manuel A. Vásquez is Professor of Religion at the University of Florida, Gainesville, USA. He is the author of More than Belief: A Materialist Theory of Religion (2011) and Living "Illegal": The Human Face of Unauthorized Immigration (2011, coauthored with Marie F. Marquardt, Timothy J. Steigenga, and Philip J. Williams).

David Garbin

David Garbin is Lecturer in Sociology at the University of Kent, UK. His fields of research include: migration and transnationalism; globalization, religion, and development; South Asian and new African diasporas in Europe and North America.

